



The Intersection of Community Values and Program Evaluations Webinar
June 24, 2020
Chat Transcript

Mara Laslo: Mara Laslo, Boston, MA, Curriculum Fellow for Graduate Education Program at Harvard Medical School

Pantea Shademani: Pantea Shademani, WP Workforce Alliance SHINE After School Program, Program Director

Sara Kobilka: Hi, it's Sara Kobilka (and crew so I'll be in and out), I'm an independent contractor involved in numerous activities with different roles including community Coordinator, project manager, Zoom meeting facilitator, trainer, curriculum designer

Charles Smith: Charles Smith, QTurn, Managing Consultant

Janel Ortiz: Janel Ortiz, Cal Poly Pomona, Assistant Professor/Researcher in Science Education

Ginger Fitzhugh: Ginger Fitzhugh, evaluator with Education Development Center

Chloe Day: Hello! I'm Chloe Day from the Bedford Public Library Youth Services department.

John Baek: John Baek, NOAA Office of Education, Internal evaluator

K Chen: Kathy Chen, Executive Director of the STEM Education Center at WPI

Shalon Hurlbert: A fellow YS Librarian! Yay!

Cary Sneider: Cary Sneider, STEM Next Opportunity Fund and Portland State University

sara bolduc | she/her | marin makerspace: Hi - Sara Bolduc (she/her), program director of Marin Makerspace

Kristin Lewis-Warner: Hello. Kristin Lewis-Warner. The PEAR Institute. Manager of STEM Partnerships and Initiatives

Mary Bonaparte-Saller: Hello! Mary Bonaparte-Saller, Associate Director USC Viterbi K-12 STEM Center.

BONITA EVERTS: Bonita Everts, Ex Director, SELF International, Minneapolis, MN

Chris Neitzey: Chris Neitzey, Director of STEM Initiatives at the Afterschool Alliance. other roles - amateur furniture maker

Melinda Higgins: Hi Melinda Higgins support DOE as Tribal STEM Advisor

Jim McGinley: Jim McGinley Ashoka and Quest for Space

Macey Shambery: Hi, Macey Shambery, AmeriCorps VISTA serving at TechPint Foundation for Youth in Indianapolis, IN

Joshua Caraballo, PsyD: Hi there! Josh from Children's Services Council of Broward County -- Research and Eval. Manager

Cathi Cox-Boniol: Equitable access to STEM experiences

Stacey Heffernan: Stacey Heffernan, Fairmount Water Works Interpretive Center, Philadelphia, PA, environmental educator

Yaneth Garcia: Yaneth, Migrant Education Program

Sarah Tropp-Pacelli: Accessibility and equity

Roxanne Hughes: equity in STEM education and opportunities

Kam Yee: Evolve away from deficit based evaluation in STEM education.

Sara Kobilka: sharing resources

sara bolduc | she/her | marin makerspace: Equitable access

Kim Lester: Equity

Macey Shambery: Social justice is the most important community value that is pressing right now. I am hoping to increase social awareness

Charles Smith: Change, equity

Shalon Hurlbert: Equality, Diversity and Inclusion

Melissa Covarrubia: Equity for our families and students

Mara Laslo: Inclusive informal science education experiences for underrepresented students

Eileen Koury: diversity in stem

Yaneth Garcia: opportunities to STEM experience

John Baek: Culturally responsive evaluation

Jim McGinley: Empathy and Education Equity

BONITA EVERTS: reconnecting after this time of separation, particularly with students

Stacey Heffernan: Inclusivity!

Cindy Ziker: Hi Everyone, My name is Cindy Ziker, Executive Director of Ziker Research in San Jose, CA.

Cary Sneider: Mutual support among all races, religions, and genders in this period of uncertainty and risk

Katie Taylor: Hi! Katie Headrick Taylor, assistant professor of learning sciences and human development at University of Washington's College of Education in Seattle.

Gabrielle Keigher: Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion

Ginger Fitzhugh: Integrating cultural responsiveness, equity, inclusion and racial justice throughout our work.

Vera Michalchik: Equity, equity, equity.

Abigail H (she/her): Equitable access (linguistic barriers, resource barriers (internet, computer, cell phones), caregiver/educator)

Dana Riley Black: Dana Riley Black | Everett Public Schools | Assistant Superintendent

Vera Michalchik: UCI Connected Learning Lab Assoc Dir

Melinda Higgins: equity and inclusion

Dana Riley Black: Systemic racism

Katie Lakey: Equitable access to learning opportunities for youth

Melissa Covarrubia: Helping students use their voice for change and to understand themselves

Katherine Weber: Community collaboration and equity

Linda Kekelis: social and economic justice--hoping to do more to listen and respond to support real change

James Bell: Hello everyone, Jamie Bell from CAISE. Equitable power-sharing collaborations that advance knowledge.

Karen Peterson: Feel free to ask questions here in the chat. We will also pause for questions as well.

Katherine Weber: What criteria was used to select the afterschool programs to qualify as a candidate for being a part of the review?

Karen Peterson: Katherine - let's see if this question is answered after Ari talks about the literature review

Katherine Weber: Sounds good:-)

Penelope Davenport: i cannot see it

Karen Peterson: Penelope - can you see it now

Penelope Davenport: Yes, thanks!

Karen Peterson: ?

Karen Peterson: Great!

Patty Allen: Assessment Tools in Informal Science (ATIS) -- now STEM!

Patty Allen: <http://pearweb.org/atis/>

Karen Peterson: We also acknowledge the National Science Foundation for this grant award:
https://www.nsf.gov/awardsearch/showAward?AWD_ID=1811487&HistoricalAwards=false

Karen Peterson: Feel free to ask questions here in the chat - and share resources.

Katherine Weber: Is the review available?

Karen Peterson: Yes, we will be publishing the literature review soon. If you are interested in commenting on it, we can send you the link.

Karen Peterson: If you are not familiar with CAISE, here is the link:
<https://www.informalscience.org/>

Katherine Weber: Yes, that would be awesome! The information is very interesting!

James Bell: Thanks for the mention, Ari and Karen! Our eval pages begin here-
<https://www.informalscience.org/what-evaluation-0>

Chris Neitzey: Reminder to share any questions you have in the chat. We will be pausing after Leah's presentation to allow for questions. You can also ask a question via video/audio if that's preferred.

Valerie Taylor: What is the name / link of the organization tool for representation?

Marisa Garcia: Valerie, it's called Coggle

Valerie Taylor: Thx

Chris Neitzey: <https://coggle.it/>

Katherine Weber: Thank you!

Katherine Weber: Although the Collective Impact Forum focus is not quite the same as the community impact focus in the Google doc, there are evaluation tools/guides that may be helpful.

Leah Silverberg: Thank you Katherine!

Karen Peterson: That is the Literature Review link.

Katherine Weber:
<https://collectiveimpactforum.org/sites/default/files/Guide%20to%20Evaluating%20CI%2001.pdf>

Derek Esbill: The google doc link is not working :(

Karen Peterson: Thanks Derek - let me check

Katherine Weber: Thank you for sharing the lit review link!

Karen Peterson: Try this one. Sorry about that:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1hWp0jJDC9H5qOgMEK--yju_Rqv-9H63RkBWikfrvJHs/edit?usp=sharing

Kam Yee: How did donors at your conference response to community driven evaluation? I can anticipate the push back from fundraisers push back because "donors want to see program growth, etc."

Karen Peterson: Kam - yes, that is a concern. We are still working through addressing all interests and needs.

Macey Shambery: Are there eval questions in the works for evaluators to us to gauge community impact? What is the plan of action to develop the tools needed to touch on Community impact & social justice?

Jen Rinehart: Kam, that is a great question. I think funders in general are supportive of community responsive programming and evaluation, but they also still want to pursue a set of common measures. So, we came out of the convening with two potential paths of work

Derek Esibill: Awesome, what kind of scope did you get?

Leah Silverberg: Environmental Justice is a great field to tackle how climate change is a social justice issue that will disproportionately affect people of color

Heidi Carlone: ^Yes, Leah!

Macey Shambery: Hi Latasha, I loved learning about the BioBus programs. What strategies do you use at BioBus to discuss the importance of inclusivity, maintain inclusivity, and promote inclusivity outside of the programs?

Katherine Weber: This is a great visual to understand the framework and very easy for teachers to understand!

Katherine Weber: This is really cool! In addition to STEM teachers, Technology Education and Engineering teachers would be big supporters of this framework.

Karen Peterson: Boyce, A. S. (2019). A re-imagining of evaluation as social justice: A discussion of the Education Justice Project. *Critical Education*, 10(1), 1-19.

Boyce, A. S., & Chouinard, J. A. (2017). Moving beyond the buzzword: A framework for teaching culturally responsive approaches to evaluation. *Canadian Journal of Program Evaluation*, 32(2), 266-279.

Boyce, A. S. (2017). Lessons learned using a values-engaged approach to attend to culture, diversity, and equity in a STEM program evaluation. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 64, 33–43.

Katherine Weber: Is there a paper or website for more info on this framework?

Karen Peterson: Yes, just put in the chat. :)

Celia Taylor: I would love a copy of this framework.

Latasha Wright: my microscope is Olympus Stereo SZX10 Microscopes with Lumenera HD Cameras

Polly Burns: ----Can we use Heidi's profile instrument?

Penelope Davenport: I had the same question as Polly

Cathi Cox-Boniol: Ditto . . . would Heidi share?

Christina Hernandez: Ditto!

Katherine Weber: That is a great perspective!

Penelope Davenport: Awesome

Kam Yee: Thank you Heidi and Latasha!!!!

Heidi Carlone: Hi all! Please email me any time— for more info about the instrument, framework, etc. Happy to share what we have. hbcarlton@uncg.edu

Katherine Weber: There is so many children still do not understand what STEM is. The profile instrument is a GREAT way for both teachers and students to see what types of "hats" can be worn when engaging in STEM.

Gil Noam: For Heidi, I am not sure I understand the point about common instrument, is your instrument not validated as a generally usable instrument? Or are you changing the questions depending on each partnership and data collection.

Marisa Garcia: Heidi's email: hbcarlton@uncg.edu

John Baek: Hi Heidi, your student profile reminds me of Todd Rose's jaggedness concept in his book, *End of Average*.

Penelope Davenport: It seems like the instrument is better served as a point of departure rather than as a conclusion?

Katherine Weber: For framework can be a great tool for teachers however the training connected to it would be key.

Cary Sneider: Regarding the Gil-Heidi discussion, it seems to me that the instrument is primarily for students to learn about themselves—not to determine the value of a program. It is not a "common" or "uncommon" instrument, but rather a useful tool in any program that would like youth to develop a STEM identity.

Katherine Weber: Cary - great comment!

Heidi Carlone: Boyce, A. S. (2019). A re-imagining of evaluation as social justice: A discussion of the Education Justice Project. *Critical Education*, 10(1), 1-19.

Boyce, A. S., & Chouinard, J. A. (2017). Moving beyond the buzzword: A framework for teaching culturally responsive approaches to evaluation. *Canadian Journal of Program Evaluation*, 32(2), 266-279.

Boyce, A. S. (2017). Lessons learned using a values-engaged approach to attend to culture, diversity, and equity in a STEM program evaluation. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 64, 33–43.

Katie Taylor: Thank you, Cary. Also, Heidi is reminding us that these categories serve as openings for students to articulate how what they're already doing is STEM.

Katie Taylor: "modes of engagement" is what she called these six categories of STEM practices

Heidi Carlone: Thanks for those points, Cary, Katie, and Gil. It's great food for thought.

Polly Burns: such a great point Latasha!

Stephanie Lauenstein: Latasha, what you are describing is a hallmark of good teaching, scientists have always found research questions in whatever surrounds them.

Latasha Wright: I agree

Derek Esibill: As part of an indigenous community, we don't call it science, we call it survival. If we are not thinking that way, we cannot survive as a species. Great point Latash!

Katie Taylor: Yes! Thank you, Derek

Chris Neitzey: Latasha touched on the concept of "community science" which is such a great opportunity for more communities (and especially youth) to address and potentially solved issues through science and research (with research partners) in their own communities

Melinda Higgins: So important Latasha--especially for students in communities that may not see many members as "STEM" people--when in fact broadening perspectives of students and their community members, family, friends, elders as STEM people helps students see themselves in a different way.

John Baek: Evaluators have developed participatory approaches like Most Significant Change where the participants define the outcomes

Linda Kekelis: Latasha how do you accommodate differences among the students--especially to encourage the minority perspective on a STEM project

Patty Allen: Heck yeah, Latasha!

Patty Allen: We spend a lot of time defending the value of youth voice, which we measure through self-report and observation. Appreciate how you put it, Latasha.

Latasha Wright: Thanks Patty

Katie Taylor: Thank you, Heidi

Gemma Lenowitz: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1Aa8ZaKp3r3pYrq6AXxztw-Nlo214k9tT/view?usp=sharing>

Katie Taylor: Thank you, Latasha

Derek Esibill: Thank you Latasha and Heidi! :)

Latasha Wright: Hi Linda. Our students are diverse. This only adds to the benefits of having students a part of the curriculum development

Penelope Davenport: What a wonderful discussion! Thank you Latasha and Heidi.

Marisa Garcia:
<https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/16CdAhxRprBtEYxR029mNiRhHgMIFbjpuRpiz8qEfHuU/edit?usp=sharing>

Marisa Garcia: ^ add thoughts here

James Bell: Excerpts from helpful interview with Heidi on her rich legacy of work on identity-
<https://www.informalscience.org/biography/heidi-carlone>

Karen Peterson: Thanks for sharing this Jamie!

Cary Sneider: I appreciate the excellent choice of our presenters, Latasha and Heidi. It's great to know about new developments in the STEM in OST fields. Both are very articulate and inspiring!

Linda Kekelis: I love this idea Give and Get. It helps me to take a pause and reflect on the webinar. Great practice!

Kristin Lewis-Warner: Can you put link in chat?

Marisa Garcia: Here's the link: Is it possible for your org to address measurement and eval in this way? What challenges do you foresee? <https://docs.google.com/document/d/1H-onTJ1MK2PV4S3kTCMagJ2dtpPUxhrFeNOFdc5-TxA/edit?usp=sharing>

Patti.Curtis: Agree w Linda - look how fast it was populated. Bravo Gemma

Heidi Carlone: Thank you so much, Gemma!

Leah Silverberg: <http://www.afterschoolstemhub.org/>

Derek Esibill: Sorry folks, I have to go. A hui hou

Cathi Cox-Boniol: Thanks all . . . I have to sign off. Appreciate this so much!

Chris Neitzey: cneitzey@afterschoolalliance.org

Katie Taylor: Thank you, Chris!

Roxanne Hughes: Thanks to you all!

Gemma Lenowitz: None of this would be possible with our PI's: Karen, Jen, and Katie!

Gemma Lenowitz: without*

Katherine Weber: Thank you for a great webinar! The time flew by!

Cinnamon Daniel: Thank you!

Heidi Carlone: Yes, thank you Karen, Jen, and Katie!

Abigail H (she/her): Thank you, I am super excited!

Marisa Garcia: Thank you, everyone!!

Patti.Curtis: Bravo!

Gemma Lenowitz: Leah for leading the map!

Kristin Lewis-Warner: Thank you all. Exciting work.

BONITA EVERTS: Thank you, everyone. This has been most helpful.